

BEFORE THE UNITED STATES JUDICIAL PANEL  
ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

FILED

IN RE DELTA DENTAL ANTITRUST  
LITIGATION

MDL DOCKET NO.

DEC 26 2019  
Dec 26 2019  
THOMAS G. BRUTON  
CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT

**PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR TRANSFER OF RELATED ACTIONS TO THE  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS FOR COORDINATED OR CONSOLIDATED  
PRETRIAL PROCEEDINGS PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1407**

Plaintiffs Robert S. Dolgow D.D.S., P.A.; B. Kyle Benton, D.D.S. P.A.; Kaufman & Kaufman Smile Design Studio LLC; Legacy Dental Associates P.C.; Dr. Rick Lindley, DDS, FICD; Dr. Steven P. Dultz DMD; Simon and Simon, PC.; Tooth Town Pediatric Dentistry, PLLC; Mary M. Fisher, DDS, P.C.; Bemus Point Dental, LLC; Rittenhouse Smiles, P.C., Timothy C. Verharen, D.D.S.; and Drs. DelMonico and Trocchio, Ltd. in the consolidated action captioned *In re Delta Dental Antitrust Litigation*, No. 1:19-cv-06734 (N.D. Ill. Nov. 26, 2019), respectfully move this Panel pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407 to transfer and coordinate or consolidate related actions in the Northern District of Illinois before the Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo.

**AVERMENTS IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION**

In support of the transfer and coordination or consolidation of these actions, Plaintiffs aver the following, as more fully set forth in the accompanying Memorandum of Law in support of this Motion:

1. Following almost a year of investigation, analysis and expert input, Plaintiff Robert S. Dolgow filed an action captioned *Dolgow v. Delta Dental Insurance Co., et al.*, No. 1:19-cv-6734, in the Northern District of Illinois on October 11, 2019. That action, and ten other

actions subsequently filed in that Court (“the Northern District of Illinois Actions”), allege nearly identical facts and legal causes of action. The first filed case was assigned to the Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo.

2. Plaintiffs in the *Dolgow* action, with the consent of all other parties in the then-pending cases, moved for reassignment of all subsequently-filed cases to Judge Bucklo. The Court held a conference with the parties on November 8, 2019. Later that day, the Court entered a minute order granting the motion to reassign all of the subsequently-filed cases to Judge Bucklo. The minute order also directed that Plaintiffs’ counsel should file a Consolidated Complaint within two weeks of the reassignment, and that Defendants should answer or otherwise respond within 60 days thereafter. The minute order also set a next court conference for January 31, 2020.

3. On November 25, 2019, Judge Bucklo entered an Initial Case Management Order (“CMO”) consolidating the Northern District of Illinois Actions for all further proceedings under the master docket number 1:19-cv-06734 and the caption *In re Delta Dental Antitrust Litigation* (the “Consolidated Action”). Among other things, the CMO also appointed Plaintiffs’ Interim Co-Lead Class Counsel and a plaintiffs Executive Committee and confirmed the case schedule for filing a consolidated complaint and briefing motions to dismiss.

4. On November 26, 2019, Plaintiffs duly filed their Consolidated Complaint in accordance with Judge Bucklo’s Order.

5. Also on November 26, 2019, almost six weeks after the *Dolgow* complaint had been filed, a twelfth related case was filed in the Northern District of Illinois captioned *American Dental Association et. al. v. Delta Dental Insurance Company et. al.*, Case No. 1:19-cv-07808-JJT and assigned to Judge John J. Tharp. Under Judge Bucklo’s reassignment order, that case should be transferred to Judge Bucklo imminently. On December 9, 2019, another action, *Dr.*

*Stephen N. Obeng, DMD v. Delta Dental Plans Association et al.*, Case No. 1:19-cv-25072-UU, was filed in the Southern District of Florida and assigned to the Honorable Ursula Ungaro and on December 11, 2019 another action, *Dr. William Dickey, DMD v. Delta Dental Plans Association*, Case No. 19-cv-00910-DPJ-FKB, was filed in the Southern District of Mississippi assigned to Judge Daniel P. Jordan. The *Dr. Stephen N. Obeng, DMD* action and the *Dr. William Dickey, DMD* action, together with any other actions that may be filed in venues other than the Northern District of Illinois, are referred to herein as the “Related Actions.”

6. As required by 28 U.S.C. § 1407(a), the Related Actions proposed for transfer and coordination or consolidation “involve[] one or more common questions of fact.”
7. The proposed transfer and centralization of the Related Actions “will be for the convenience of the parties and witnesses and will promote the just and efficient conduct” of the actions. See 28 U.S.C. § 1407(a).
8. Movants base this Motion on the accompanying Memorandum in Support of their Motion to Transfer and Coordinate or Consolidate, the exhibits thereto, and such other matters as may be presented to the Panel at the time of hearing.

Dated: December 13, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

**QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &  
SULLIVAN, LLP**

By /s/ Stephen R. Neuwirth

Stephen R. Neuwirth

Toby E. Futter

Joseph Kiefer

51 Madison Avenue, 22<sup>nd</sup> Floor

New York, New York 10010

Telephone: 212 849-7000

stephenneuwirth@quinnmanuel.com

tobyfutter@quinnmanuel.com

joekiefer@quinnmanuel.com

Leonid Feller, P.C.

Athena Dalton

191 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 2700

Chicago, Illinois 60606

Telephone: (312) 705-7400

leonidfeller@quinnmanuel.com

athenadalon@quinnmanuel.com

*Interim Co-Lead Class Counsel*

**WOLLMUTH MAHER & DEUTSCH LLP**

By /s/ Ronald J. Aranoff

Ronald J. Aranoff

Cassandra Postighone

500 Fifth Avenue – 12<sup>th</sup> Floor

New York, New York 10110

Telephone: (212) 382-3300

aranoff@wmd-law.com

cpostinghone@wmd-law.com

*Interim Co-Lead Class Counsel*

**KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER LLP**

Robert N. Kaplan  
Gregory Arenson  
Elana Katcher  
850 Third Avenue  
New York, New York 10022  
Telephone: (212) 687-1980  
[rkaplan@kaplanfox.com](mailto:rkaplan@kaplanfox.com)  
[garenson@kaplanfox.com](mailto:garenson@kaplanfox.com)  
[ekatcher@kaplanfox.com](mailto:ekatcher@kaplanfox.com)

*Chair, Plaintiffs' Interim Executive Committee*

**SPECTOR ROSEMAN & KODROFF, P.C.**

Eugene A. Spector  
Jeffrey L. Spector  
William G. Caldes  
2001 Market Street, Suite 3420  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 496-0300  
[espector@srkattorneys.com](mailto:espector@srkattorneys.com)  
[jspector@srkattorneys.com](mailto:jspector@srkattorneys.com)  
[bcaldes@srkattorneys.com](mailto:bcaldes@srkattorneys.com)

*Member, Plaintiffs' Interim Executive Committee*

**MALKINSON & HALPERN, P.C.**

John R. Malkinson  
33 North Dearborn Street, Suite  
1540 Chicago, IL 60602  
Telephone: (312) 427-9600  
[jmalkinson@mtriallaw.com](mailto:jmalkinson@mtriallaw.com)

*Member, Plaintiffs' Interim Executive Committee*

**RADICE LAW FIRM**

John Radice  
April Dawn Lambert  
475 Wall Street  
Princeton, NJ 08540  
Telephone (312) 339-7140  
[radice@radicelawfirm.com](mailto:radice@radicelawfirm.com)  
[alambert@radicelawfirm.com](mailto:alambert@radicelawfirm.com)

*Member, Plaintiffs' Interim Executive Committee*

**PRETI, FLAHERTY, BELIVEAU &  
PACHIOS, LLP**

Gregory P. Hansel  
Randall B. Weill  
Michael S. Smith  
Elizabeth F. Quinby  
One City Center  
P.O. Box 9546  
Portland, ME 04112-9546  
Telephone: (207) 791-3000  
[ghansel@preti.com](mailto:ghansel@preti.com)  
[rweill@preti.com](mailto:rweill@preti.com)  
[msmith@preti.com](mailto:msmith@preti.com)  
[equinby@preti.com](mailto:equinby@preti.com)

*Member, Plaintiffs' Interim Executive Committee*

**CARNEY, BATES, AND PULLIAM, PLLC**

William P. Creasman  
519 W. 7th St.  
Little Rock, Arkansas 72201  
Telephone: (501) 312-8500  
wcreasman@cbplaw.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

**BERNSTEIN LIEBHARD LLP**

Stanley D. Bernstein  
Stephanie M. Beige  
10 East 40th Street  
New York, NY 10016  
Telephone: (212) 779-1414  
bernstein@bernlieb.com  
beige@bernlieb.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

**FREED KANNER LONDON &  
MILLEN LLC**

William H. London  
2201 Waukegan Road, Suite 130  
Bannockburn, IL 60015  
Telephone: (224) 632-4500  
wlondon@fkmlaw.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

**REINHARD WENDORF & BLANCHFIELD**

Garrett D. Blanchfield, Jr.  
Brant D. Penney  
332 Minnesota Street, Suite W-1050  
St. Paul, MN 55101  
Telephone: (651) 287-2100  
Facsimile: (651) 287-2103  
g.blanchfield@rwblawfirm.com  
b.penney@rwblawfirm.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

**KELLER RORHBACK L.L.P.**

Mark A. Griffin  
Raymond Farrow  
1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200  
Seattle, WA 98101  
Telephone: (206) 623-1900  
mgriffin@kellerrohrback.com  
rfarrow@kellerrohrback.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

**MCLAFFERTY LAW FIRM, P.C.**

David P. McLafferty  
923 Fayette Street  
Conshohocken, PA 19428  
Telephone: (610) 940-4000 ext. 12  
dmclafferty@mclaffertylaw.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*